#### THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 26 October 2017 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 20 October 2017.

Present: County Councillor Derbyshire (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ahmed, Asghar Ali, Dilwar Ali, Bale, Berman, Bowden, Bowen-Thomson, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke-Davies, Carter, Congreve, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ford, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Henshaw, Gavin Hill-John, Philippa Hill-John, Hinchey, Howells, Hudson, Jacobsen, Jenkins, Jones-Pritchard, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Lancaster, Lay, Lent, Lister, Mackie, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Molik, Morgan, Naughton, Owen, Parkhill, Jackie Parry, Keith Parry, Patel, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sandrey, Sattar, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Lynda Thorne, Walker, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong and Wood

68 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Councillors Murphy and Phillips

69 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Councillor Joel Williams declared an interest in Item 9 (Statements) on the basis that he is a Director of Diverse Cymru and Cartref Care Homes.

70 : MINUTES

The Council was reminded that it was agreed that the final wording of the Composite Motion CARRIED at the last meeting would be agreed between the Proposer of the Motion and the Proposers of the two amendments, and published as part of the minutes of this meeting.

The Composite Motion was confirmed as follows:

The Council notes that

- 1. As Elected Members we have responsibility for our City and that includes creating sustainable communities, with comprehensive plans to deliver achievable network, cycle, pedestrian and road solutions. We also have a responsibility for the health and wellbeing of current and future generations.
- 2. Cardiff Council recognises that growth across the city has put serious pressure on our transport system. We are also aware of the dangerous health implications from air pollution caused primarily by motor vehicles.

- 3. There is a serious challenge facing Cardiff to provide suitable public transport options as the city grows during the Local Development Plan period and beyond. An increase in public transport capacity within Cardiff is essential. This, at a minimum, needs to be in line with the growth forecasts included in the LDP and to cater for an increase in commuters arriving from neighbouring authorities.
- 4. In addition to public transport we recognise the importance of providing improved infrastructure for active travel in the city. Cycling and walking not only provide alternatives to car journeys, but can improve our overall health and wellbeing.

#### The Council calls on the Cabinet

1. To bring forward a Green Paper to allow a full conversation with a wide-range of stakeholders on the future of Cardiff's transport system by the end of the financial year.

RESOLVED – That the minutes of the 28 September 2017 were AGREED as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

#### 71 : PETITIONS

- 1 Councillor Philippa Hill-John 117 signatures requesting the reinstatement of the lollipop person at the crossing leading to the rear of Llandaff City Primary School on Cardiff Road.
- Councillor Ramesh Patel 61 signatures requesting the installation of a lockable gate, with future access with a key held by local residents only at the bottom of Lansdowne Avenue West, Canton
- 3 Councillor Ashley Wood 77 signatures calling for an extension of the gating currently covering the rear lane behind Heathfield Road to cover the lane running between Heathfield Place and Pen-y-Bryn
- 4 Councillor Cowan 157 signatures calling on the Council to repair and replace all play equipment it has currently removed from Llanishen Fach Open Space, and for any other equipment needing repair to be either repaired or replaced.
- 5 Councillor Ashley Wood 20 signatures calling on the Council to introduce measures to deal with the double parking on Herbert Street and to prevent road blocking.
- 6 Councillor Owen Jones 111 signatures urging Cardiff Council to refuse planning permission to Crosslane Student Developments to build a new purpose built 10-storey student accommodation on Howard Gardens in Newport Road Lane.

### 72 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

Public Question: Eleanor Sanders

As Chair of Trustees at Cardiff Foodbank, I am very concerned the impact of the introduction, in February 2018, of Universal Credit will have on those already in need and poverty across our city. Based on the experiences reported in other cities, we at

the Foodbank anticipate an increase in numbers coming to our seven Distribution Centres across the city. We have already seen over 10% increase year on year for the last few years. Whilst we obviously want to provide support through advice and non-perishable food, it's so sad that it is needed in the first place. What is the Council doing to ensure those having to move to Universal Credit will be well supported when making the transition, and won't be left in increased need through avoidable delay or errors?

Reply: Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities Councillor Thorne

I genuinely share the concern about the impact that Universal Credit will have on our vulnerable citizens.

I recently attended a meeting with Cabinet Members from across Wales where grave concerns were expressed by the pilot Authorities about delays in payments and rent arrears. We agreed to write a joint letter to the Westminster Government to ask them to halt the roll out of Universal Credit until the fundamental flaws with the benefit have been addressed. Unfortunately, I don't think that will happen although there is some breaking news this morning that the Government has dropped plans to cap Housing Benefit in the social housing sector, which would have affected under 35's, who would have only received Housing Benefit for a room in a shared house; it would have affected Pensioners who are under occupying properties and it would have given an uncertain future for our Sheltered Accommodation.

Currently, in Cardiff, only new claims for single working people are paid through Universal Credit; however, from the end of February next year, "Full Service" will commence and this will apply to most new claimants, including families and disabled people.

The Council's Advice team is already providing help to those affected by Universal Credit. This help is available across the city in Hubs and other community venues, including the Food Banks.

Digital support is available to help people to claim online, to maintain their account and avoid sanctions.

Budgeting support is also available to help people to manage their money; this is vital as payments of Universal Credit are not made until at least 5 or 6 weeks after the claim and some local authorities are reporting a much longer delay.

Help will be available for people to request an Advance Payment from Universal Credit and to ensure that all grants, discounts, hardship or emergency payments available are claimed.

A full action plan has been developed to address the change from February next year. This includes increasing the number of public access PCs available across the city and ensuring that more staff are trained to provide help.

An awareness campaign is planned and full training will be provided for staff and key partners such as housing associations and support providers. Consideration is also being given to how best to help and support private landlords with the change in order to avoid arrears and prevent homelessness wherever possible.

I very much appreciate the work undertaken by the Food Banks in the city and I hope that we can continue to work together to help alleviate poverty and support those who are vulnerable in our City.

Supplementary Public Question: Eleanor Sanders

I hope it's evident that my principle intention for coming here this afternoon is to highlight the plight of many across our City. It really grieves me to think that there are adults and children who are hungry today. I'm committed through Foodbank to provide emergency food to them but they need to be brought to our attention and signposted appropriately.

Could I ask therefore that you commit to your Council staff to work closely with us to help meet need, particularly with the predicted spike in demand from next February?

There is evidence that where Universal Credit is implemented, Foodbanks see an increased referral rate of around 17%. In Cardiff, that would mean providing food to approximately an additional 2500 individuals based on last year's figures, where we were able to provide emergency food to 14500 people. On top of the year on year increases, we need to manage this in partnerships, as when individuals are hungry, through the delays from next February, Foodbank will almost certainly be the default referral source.

Reply: Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities Councillor Thorne

We are putting plans in place to make sure we help as many people and we will certainly work with you to make sure that everybody who needs to be, is directed. I think we also need to work together to make sure that we have a real push on perhaps getting people to donate to Foodbanks, because sometimes when it's been happening for a long time, it drops off and we perhaps need to promote that more and have a real campaign on it so I would love to work with you on both things.

#### 73 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

## **Betty Campbell**

It was with great sadness the Lord Mayor reported that Betty Campbell former Councillor passed away on Friday 13 October 2017 at the age of 82. Betty was born in her beloved community of Butetown which she served as a Councillor, Community Leader and Head Teacher. Betty was a champion of education; diversity and fairness and would be hugely missed by her close and extended family in Butetown and beyond.

Contributions were received from Councillors, Merry, Walker, Berman, McEvoy, Ebrahim and Cowan

Over the last month the Lord Mayor had attended many varied events, including the unveiling of a Falklands War Memorial, the unveiling of the long awaited statue of Mahatma Gandhi in the Bay and the Swiss Ambassador's Award Concert. The Lord Mayor also attended a presentation at HMS Cambia detailing their newly approved £11million state of the art facility which will be constructed in Cardiff Bay with an expected completion date of March 2019.

Visits also took place from French Naval Officers, a group of enthusiastic Swiss Students and the newly appointed Naval Regional Commander for Wales and Western England. In addition the Lord Mayor had hosted two British Citizenship Ceremonies and delighted in being able to recognise two of Cardiff's citizens on reaching their 100<sup>th</sup> birthdays.

Fundraising was continuing with RSPB Cymru and Bug life Cymru and I'd like to remind Members that pin badges are available to purchase at City Hall, County Hall, Cardiff Castle and the Norwegian Church, with proceeds going to the Lord Mayor's Charity.

Next month the Lord Mayor would be attending a number of events to commemorate those who lost their lives in the 2 world wars and subsequent conflicts. The Lord Mayor hoped colleagues would also attend one of the various remembrance services on the 12 November.

Members were advised of the Bangladesh Association of Cardiff Fundraising appeal for Rohingya Refugees. So far the Association has collected over £10,000 and has a target to raise £50,000 to support the Crisis Appeal. On Wednesday between 5pm and Midnight the Association has organised a curry evening at a number of restaurants and details would be circulated.

Details of the Recognitions and Awards since the last meeting had been circulated around the Chamber today and we congratulate all those involved on their success.

# 74 : CARDIFF COUNCIL STATUTORY IMPROVEMENT PLAN

The Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation and Performance, Councillor Weaver proposed the Annual Statutory Improvement Report 2016-17. This was seconded by the Leader Councillor Huw Thomas.

The report had been prepared to enable the Cabinet to approve the Council's Annual Statutory Improvement Report, a document required under the Local Government (Wales) Measures 2009 for submission to Council in October 2017 and its publication by 31 October 2017.

Cabinet Members reported on the following four priorities identified as key areas of focus:

- Better Education and Skills for all
- Supporting Vulnerable People
- Creating More and Better Paid jobs
- Working Together to Transform Services

The Council's improvement objectives were addressed band what the Council was focusing on.

During the debate Members raised issues around Benchmarking, Welsh Government Improvement statistics and challenges. Educational performance in Science, Maths and Reading compared to the rest of Wales. The lack of reference to the UN Rights of a Child in the report, along with EIA training. Highways details and road cleanliness statistics; sickness absence days lost in the last year and overall customer satisfaction.

The Cabinet Member responded to the issues raised, drawing attention to the recording and reporting of performance indicators. Significant improvements in Education was being recorded and sickness absence was being addressed.

A vote was taken on the report and the report was CARRIED.

RESOLVED – that the Council's Annual Statutory Improvement Report be approved for publication by 31 October 2017.

75 : APPOINTMENT OF COMMUNITY COUNCILLOR TO THE STANDARDS & ETHICS COMMITTEE

The Council considered the recommendations of the Standards & Ethics Committee Appointment Panel of 13 October 2017 for the appointment to the Community Council Member vacancy.

#### **RESOLVED - That**

- the recommendation of the Standards & Ethics Committee Appointment Panel following the selection process on 13 October 2017 to appoint Community Councillor Richard Stuart Thomas to the vacancy for the Community Council Member on the Standards & Ethics Committee with effect from 27 October 2017 be approved.
- 2. the term of office being until the next ordinary Local election, which may be extended to one further consecutive term.

#### 76 : STATEMENTS

The following statements were received:

# 1. Leader Statement

The Leader responded to questions on his statement in relation to Well-Being Plan; how policies were put forward to Public Health Wales; Core Cities and City Deal, Air Quality Plan, Cleaner Air Strategy affecting public transport and the expansion of electrical vehicles charging points.

2. Cabinet Member for Housing & Communities

The Cabinet Member answered questions on her statement in relation to commitment to building homes; donation boxes for rough sleepers; assurance of retention of the library service in Rhiwbina and support of the summer reading challenge.

# 3. Cabinet Member, Children & Families

The Cabinet Member answered questions on his statement relating to early interventions in school to prevent Child Sexual Exploitation and the involvement of Partners and the MASH service.

# 4. Cabinet Member, Social Care, Health & Well-being

The Cabinet Member answered questions on her statement in relation to Older Persons Accommodation linked into the Local Development Plan and plans in place to support senior citizens on a digital level.

# 5. Cabinet Member, Strategic Planning & Transport

The Cabinet Member answered questions on his statement relating to gritting of the Taff Trail and cycling training.

# 6. Cabinet Member, Investment & Development

The Cabinet Member answered questions on his statement in relation to land disposals, NCP car park and the Bus Station.

#### 7. Cabinet Member, Culture & Leisure

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on his statement relating to footpath work in Parc Coed –y-Nant and events held in Cardiff and the infrastructure in place to support this.

# 8. Deputy Leader, Education, Employment & Skills

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on her statement in relation to, Employable Me, Black History Month and European Day of Languages.

## 9. Cabinet Member, Finance Modernisation & Performance

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on his statement relating to web stats, living wage and commitments to webcasting

#### 77 : NOTICE OF MOTION

The Lord Mayor advised that a notice of motion proposed by Councillor Rhys Taylor and seconded by Councillor Joe Carter had been submitted and was included on the Summons for the meeting.

The Notice of Motion was as follows:

A fair education system ensures that economic disadvantage is not a barrier to accessing appropriate education

The Council notes that:

- The Council endorses the corporate aim to narrow educational outcomes and opportunities;
- 2) Notes the increase in the number of pupils from 27,789 in 2010 to 33,469 in January 2017;
- Notes that demand for English medium places at entry to secondary education will be expected by September 2019; and demand for Welsh medium places at entry to secondary education will be exceeded by September 2021;
- 4) Notes the current pressures on the school estate and that nearly 20% of pupils did not secure any of their first three choices for secondary school places in 2016/17:
- 5) Notes that the attainment gap at Key Stage 4 for those children in receipt of Free School Meals was 33.7 in 2017;
- 6) Acknowledges that families with the economic means to do so are able to move within catchment areas so as to secure places at over0subscribed schools, leading to a loss of community cohesion and potentially widening educational outcomes and opportunities.

#### This Council calls on the Cabinet to:

- 1) Carry out a financial exercise as part of the budget consultation process and in order to inform the budget debate, calculating:
  - a. The impact of providing free secondary school transport to anyone living over 2.5 miles from their school;
  - b. The projected cost of reintroducing discretionary travel provision for young adults with learning or physical disabilities in 16-19 education, as allowed for in Section 6 of the Learner Travel (Wales) Measure 2008
- 2) Bring to November's Council meeting a detailed outline of how it will deal with the imminent lack of sufficient places in the city's existing secondary schools.

The Lord Mayor advised that two amendments to the motion had been received:-

#### Amendment 1:

Proposed by: Councillor Sean Driscoll Seconded by: Councillor Gavin Hill-John

The opening sentence delete the words 'is not a barrier' and replace with "and disability are not barriers".

Under the resolution point 1 (b) add a second sentence

"This is to include 16 – 19 year olds transferring to a recognised further education establishment that have been denied transport due to the 2015 transport policy of phased withdrawal of the service."

The addition of a new point 3

"3. Bring to the November Council meeting a detailed solution of how it will imminently reverse the decision to withdraw funding for children with disabilities

(that are unable to use the bus transport to school scheme) who moved to further education in 2017/18".

#### The amended motion would then read:

A fair education system ensures that economic disadvantage and disability are not barriers to accessing appropriate education.

#### This Council:

- endorses the corporate aim to narrow educational outcomes and opportunities;
- notes the increase in the number of pupils from 27,789 in 2010 to 33,469 in January 2017;
- notes that demand for English medium places at entry to secondary education will be exceeded by September 2019; and demand for Welsh medium places at entry to secondary education will be exceeded by September 2021;
- notes the current pressures on the school estate and that nearly 20% of pupils did not secure any of their first three choices for secondary school places in 2016/17:
- notes that the attainment gap at Key Stage 4 for those children in receipt of Free School Meals was 33.7 in 2017;
- acknowledges that families with the economic means to do so are able to move within catchment areas so as to secure places at over-subscribed schools, leading to a loss of community cohesion and potentially widening educational outcomes and opportunities.

#### This Council calls on the administration to:

- 1. Carry out a financial exercise as part of the budget consultation process and in order to inform the budget debate, calculating:
  - a. the impact of providing free secondary school transport to anyone living over 2.5 miles from their high school;
  - b. the projected cost of reintroducing discretionary travel provision for young adults with learning or physical disabilities in 16 19 education, as allowed for in Section 6 of the Learner Travel (Wales) Measure 2008. This is to include 16 19 year olds transferring to a recognised further education establishment that have been denied transport due to the 2015 transport policy of phased withdrawal of the service.
- 2. Bring to November's council meeting a detailed outline of how it will deal with the imminent lack of sufficient places in the city's existing secondary schools.
- 3. Bring to the November Council meeting a detailed solution of how it will imminently reverse the decision to withdraw funding for children with disabilities (that are unable to use the bus transport to school scheme) who moved to further education in 2017/18.

#### Amendment 2:

Proposed by: Councillor Sarah Merry

Seconded by: Councillor Lee Bridgeman

Bullet point 1 – add the following words after opportunities and applauds the aspiration of Capital Ambition and Cardiff 2020

Add a new Bullet point 2

• Notes the improvement in results for children on free school meals in Cardiff between 2012 & 16 including a 16% improvement for efsm pupils in the achieving the Foundation Phase Outcome indicator at the end of year 2, 14.5% improvement in efsm pupils achieving the CSI at end of year 6, 17.8% improvement in efsm pupils achieving CSI at end of year 9 and a 19% improvement in the number of efsm pupils achieving level 2+ at the end of year 11 between 2012-16. Cardiff went from below the Welsh average to above the Welsh average on each of these indicators.

Bullet Point 2 becomes bullet Point 3

Bullet Point 3 amend second line by deleting 27,789 and replace with 28,450 and deleting 22, 469 and replace with 34,078

Bullet Point 3 after January 2017 add the following and further notes that the improvement in outcomes for efsm pupils has taken place when numbers in pupils have been increasing and standards rising overall. We recognise the efforts made by staff and schools as well as the LEA and consortium.

Bullet Point 4 add the following after September 2021.

Further notes the clear recognition by the cabinet of the challenges of our school estate in the paper "Developing our School Estate" that went to Cabinet in October.

Bullet Point 5 – delete and replace with

 notes that despite application numbers for secondary schools increasing from 2476 in 2016 to 2604 in 2017 there was a fall in the percentage of children not receiving a community school place offer from 14.5% to 10.8%. We also note that only 66 pupils (2.5% of the total number of applicants) were refused all 3 preferences. We believe this reflects the work of Cardiff Council in providing information to parents and changes in the application process.

Delete bullet point 6 and replace with

 notes that in the Key Stage 4 Level 2+ threshold (5 GCSEs A\*-C including English/Welsh and Maths), the performance of pupils eligible for Free School Meals in Cardiff was 30.8% in 2017, compared to 26.8% across the Central South Consortium. However we note the attainment gap for the Key Stage 4 Level 2+ threshold was 33.7ppt: closing the attainment gap has been and remains a priority for Cardiff Council.

Delete bullet point 7 and replace with

Recognises the importance of providing consistently good education across the
city and the importance of sharing good practice in closing the attainment gap.
We recognise that examination results do not measure the "value added"
performance of schools and we also recognise the importance of challenging
schools on how they deliver for all their pupils

# Delete all after This Council and replace with

- (i) Calls on the cabinet Secretary Kirsty Williams to make an announcement as quickly as possible around funding for schools under Band B and to accept in full our submission to enable Cardiff Council to bring forward plans to address issues in the schools estate which include the need to expand school places, the condition of our school buildings and meeting the needs of pupils with ALN;
- (ii) Resolves to write to the cabinet Secretary asking the Welsh Government to give consideration to whether additional funding for schools transport for pupils living more than 2.5 miles from their high school could be provided;
- (iii) Asks the administration to bring forward plans to address the issues outlined in "Developing our School Estate" after the outcome of Band B is known and there has been time to fully consider how we best meet future challenges.

#### The Amended motion would read

A fair education system ensures that economic disadvantage is not a barrier to accessing appropriate education.

# This Council:

- endorses the corporate aim to narrow educational outcomes and opportunities and applauds the aspiration of Capital Ambition and Cardiff 2020.
- notes the improvement in results for children on free school meals in Cardiff between 2012 & 16 including a 16% improvement for efsm pupils in the achieving the Foundation Phase Outcome indicator at the end of year 2, 14.5% improvement in efsm pupils achieving the CSI at end of year 6, 17.8% improvement in efsm pupils achieving CSI at end of year 9 and a 19% improvement in the number of efsm pupils achieving level 2+ at the end of year 11 between 2012-16. Cardiff went from below the Welsh average to above the Welsh average on each of these indicators.
- notes the increase in the number of pupils from 28,450 in 2010 to 34,078 in January 2017 and further notes that the improvement in outcomes for efsm pupils has taken place when numbers in pupils have been increasing and standards rising overall. We recognise the efforts made by staff and schools as well as the LEA and consortium.

- notes that demand for English medium places at entry to secondary education will be exceeded by September 2019; and demand for Welsh medium places at entry to secondary education will be exceeded by September 2021. Further notes the clear recognition by the cabinet of the challenges of our school estate in the paper "Developing our School Estate" that went to cabinet in October.
- notes that despite application numbers for secondary schools increasing from 2476 in 2016 to 2604 in 2017 there was a fall in the percentage of children not receiving a community school place offer from 14.5% to 10.8%. We also note that only 66 pupils (2.5% of the total number of applicants) were refused all 3 preferences. We believe this reflects the work of Cardiff Council in providing information to parents and changes in the application process.
- notes that in the Key Stage 4 Level 2+ threshold (5 GCSEs A\*-C including English/Welsh and Maths), the performance of pupils eligible for Free School Meals in Cardiff was 30.8% in 2017, compared to 26.8% across the Central South Consortium. However we note the attainment gap for the Key Stage 4 Level 2+ threshold was 33.7ppt: closing the attainment gap has been and remains a priority for Cardiff Council.
- recognises the importance of providing consistently good education across the
  city and the importance of sharing good practice in closing the attainment gap.
  We recognise that examination results do not measure the "value added"
  performance of schools and we also recognise the importance of challenging
  schools on how they deliver for all their pupils

# This Council:

- (i) Calls on the cabinet Secretary Kirsty Williams to make an announcement as quickly as possible around funding for schools under Band B and to accept in full our submission to enable Cardiff Council to bring forward plans to address issues in the schools estate which include the need to expand school places, the condition of our school buildings and meeting the needs of pupils with ALN;
- (ii) Resolves to write to the cabinet Secretary asking the Welsh Government to give consideration to whether additional funding for schools transport for pupils living more than 2.5 miles from their high school could be provided;
- (iii) Asks the administration to bring forward plans to address the issues outlined in "Developing our School Estate" after the outcome of Band B is known and there has been time to fully consider how we best meet future challenges.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion. At the conclusion of the debate the Lord Mayor invited Councillor Rhys Taylor to sum up. In summing up Councillor Taylor confirmed that the he accepted Amendment 1.

The Lord Mayor indicated that as Amendment 1 had been accepted that this became the substantive proposed motion from Councillor Rhys Taylor.

The Lord Mayor asked for a vote to be taken on Amendment 2 from Councillor Merry was taken.

The vote was CARRIED

Councillor Merry was provided the right of reply before the vote was taken on the Substantive Motion.

The Motion was CARRIED as follows:

A fair education system ensures that economic disadvantage is not a barrier to accessing appropriate education.

#### This Council:

- endorses the corporate aim to narrow educational outcomes and opportunities and applauds the aspiration of Capital Ambition and Cardiff 2020.
- notes the improvement in results for children on free school meals in Cardiff between 2012 & 16 including a 16% improvement for efsm pupils in the achieving the Foundation Phase Outcome indicator at the end of year 2, 14.5% improvement in efsm pupils achieving the CSI at end of year 6, 17.8% improvement in efsm pupils achieving CSI at end of year 9 and a 19% improvement in the number of efsm pupils achieving level 2+ at the end of year 11 between 2012-16. Cardiff went from below the Welsh average to above the Welsh average on each of these indicators.
- notes the increase in the number of pupils from 28,450 in 2010 to 34,078 in January 2017 and further notes that the improvement in outcomes for efsm pupils has taken place when numbers in pupils have been increasing and standards rising overall. We recognise the efforts made by staff and schools as well as the LEA and consortium.
- notes that demand for English medium places at entry to secondary education will be exceeded by September 2019; and demand for Welsh medium places at entry to secondary education will be exceeded by September 2021. Further notes the clear recognition by the cabinet of the challenges of our school estate in the paper "Developing our School Estate" that went to cabinet in October.
- notes that despite application numbers for secondary schools increasing from 2476 in 2016 to 2604 in 2017 there was a fall in the percentage of children not receiving a community school place offer from 14.5% to 10.8%. We also note that only 66 pupils (2.5% of the total number of applicants) were refused all 3 preferences. We believe this reflects the work of Cardiff Council in providing information to parents and changes in the application process.
- notes that in the Key Stage 4 Level 2+ threshold (5 GCSEs A\*-C including English/Welsh and Maths), the performance of pupils eligible for Free School Meals in Cardiff was 30.8% in 2017, compared to 26.8% across the Central South Consortium. However we note the attainment gap for the Key Stage 4 Level 2+

threshold was 33.7ppt: closing the attainment gap has been and remains a priority for Cardiff Council.

recognises the importance of providing consistently good education across the
city and the importance of sharing good practice in closing the attainment gap.
We recognise that examination results do not measure the "value added"
performance of schools and we also recognise the importance of challenging
schools on how they deliver for all their pupils

#### This Council:

- (i) Calls on the cabinet Secretary Kirsty Williams to make an announcement as quickly as possible around funding for schools under Band B and to accept in full our submission to enable Cardiff Council to bring forward plans to address issues in the schools estate which include the need to expand school places, the condition of our school buildings and meeting the needs of pupils with ALN;
- (ii) Resolves to write to the cabinet Secretary asking the Welsh Government to give consideration to whether additional funding for schools transport for pupils living more than 2.5 miles from their high school could be provided;

Asks the administration to bring forward plans to address the issues outlined in "Developing our School Estate" after the outcome of Band B is known and there has been time to fully consider how we best meet future challenges.

78 : ORAL QUESTIONS

# **QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR COWAN**

Will the Cabinet Member advise why there are continuing supply problems with regard to green bag availability in Cardiff North?

# REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

I'm not aware of any supply issues with green bags in Cardiff North or across the city. All stockists have received their correct deliveries, but please let me know if you are aware of any specific problems.

Residents can order online, over the phone, complete the orange sticker on the bags or call into a local hub in order to replenish their supply.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR COWAN

I've been here 18 years and I have to say that I am staggered at that response Councillor Michael. You are fully aware of the issues, you were copied into a very long Facebook chain saying there is shortage problems with Maes-y-coed Centre, Rhiwbina library and Deri Stores, so I'm perplexed that you are saying there is no problem.

The question is, a number of residents have said that they need to either double bag green bags or use more because of the poorer quality in recent years, isn't this false economy?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

I think there is a bit of confusion here, putting something on Facebook is not the same as ringing or emailing me or officers. If we don't get this information we don't know there is a problem.

As far as the quality of the bags is concerned, it might come as a great shock to you but they are there to put recycling in, within a day they are in the MRF where they are ripped, so the last thing you want is really good quality green bags you are going to rip them and clog up the system. I'm more than happy to take you and show you what happens to these green bags, they are ripped and recycled.

But to go back to what you said originally I'm not aware of any problems, officers are not aware of any problems, if you would like to email me or officers then we would know about it.

## QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR BERMAN

At the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee meeting on 4 October, one of the Wales Audit Office representatives present agreed with me that having a general contingency fund within the council's budget as a safety net to cover overspends for planned savings that are not achieved can lead to the council applying less rigour in attempting to achieve those savings, thereby potentially lessening the likelihood that they are achieved. Will you therefore reconsider the use of such a general contingency fund in future budgets?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WEAVER

Firstly I have to say I agree with you and fiscal discipline is absolutely necessary, in making sure we achieve savings and progress to achieve those savings happen throughout the year, they are closely monitored by both senior managers and Cabinet and challenged throughout the year in order to ensure that we do that. A bit of background about the contingency line you asked about, the Council has had to identify and make over £200 million in savings over the past decade, over £100m of which were in the past three years. A similar scale of £70million plus is expected over the next three years.

Taking into account that Cardiff is at the lower end of the spectrum in terms of general reserves – the £3million general contingency is an important part of the Council's financial resilience. It is constantly under review though, last year the amount was reduced by 25% from £4million to £3million, it will be under review every year that budgets are passed, that is the background and that is the financial resilience and the importance it plays in that has been the reason for having that line.

# SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR BERMAN

We heard from the Wales Audit Office of one Authority which had got rid with such a contingency fund and therefore had greater success in achieving its savings subsequent to that.

Would you not accept that by keeping a £3million contingency fund, effectively as an authority we have been perhaps increasing Council Tax by more than we needed to and also making it more likely potentially that we get into financial difficulty in the year after that?

I'm grateful that you are going to review it but do you accept that we could have greater financial discipline if we removed the fund.

# REPLY - COUNTY COUNCLLOR WEAVER

I don't necessarily accept that at all, that was one comment about one Authority that was given anecdotally. The Wales Audit Office as far as we are aware does not give advice on which is preferable in terms of achieving your financial savings or your financial resilience. Without knowing the background of that Authority in terms of its scale of reserves, scale of savings it has to make, its overall financial planning etc. I couldn't honestly say whether it is even comparable to Cardiff at all, but I would be happy to hear more about that particular Authority. I will say we have to recognise the deep uncertainty that we still have, the budget is being set in Westminster in November, we will hear the final settlement here in December, we have the car crash that is the ongoing Brexit negotiations, we literally don't know where our public financing will be over the years ahead and I think we have to make decisions prudently when we consider our budget lines.

# SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR ROBSON

I think Councillor Berman has an important point here that over the last 4/5 years of Labour's term there has been between £12million and £16million in contingency budget fund budgeting and I think that is quite shameful by this Council. I have said this many times in this Chamber - I appreciate you have just taken the portfolio on - but when you come to review it as you've outlined you will, will you look to take that money off the Council tax rate because 3.7% proposed increase is simply too high?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILOR WEAVER

Every line of a budget has to be justified and we have to feel confident that it's right. I will point out some of the areas of overspend we have are areas that many other local authorities are facing, Children's services, Education and in Cardiff this year we have seen in relation to the Material Recycling Facility, all of those are affected by factors that are out of the direct control of the Council and part of that contingency fund gives us the confidence that we are able to address that in year without making drastic cuts to services that people actually rely on. We have to have that balance to whether or not this is giving us greater flexibility to protect services and dealing with those external factors and shocks that we know will affect and authority of this size.

As ever, the budget will be heavily scrutinised each year of the five years of this administration and of course as evidence changes everyone is entitled to change

opinions but I have to say so far there has been a good reason to have that line and we should be very cautious about what we change in relation to it.

# **QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR GORDON**

What plans does Council have to monitor and reduce traffic speeds in the 20 mph zone in Pontcanna and Riverside?

### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

Once the 20 mph zone is finally put in place across Canton and Riverside, there will be a high profile communications campaign around speeds. I do know that local PCSO officers have been going to some of the hotspots in the meantime but obviously we want to see how the 20mph zones bed in before we look about whether we need to do any more mitigating on that.

# SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR GORDON

I wonder whether we could perhaps at this stage, make an effort to improve awareness of the 20mph limit by writing to all the drivers that are driving around our area like the bus companies, coach companies, taxi firms and the delivery vehicles? Could the Director of Transportation and Planning write to all these companies and inform them that there is a 20mph zone in Riverside and Canton and perhaps that would be a good beginning to set the speed as it were for the ordinary private motorist?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

I think that's an excellent idea and I absolutely will. Just on that, we did meet Cardiff Bus this week and specifically raised that issue with them and also I have asked Councillor Parry whether I can speak with the taxi drivers, I'm hoping to speak to them next week, a number of the taxi firms any how about that but those ideas are great and I will get a letter sorted.

# SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR NAUGHTON

My question is along similar lines but for Pentwyn and Llanedeyrn, what can the Cabinet Member do about 20 mph speed limits in my ward?

#### REPLY – COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

The plan at the moment is to roll out the 20mph zones across the City centre zones, there is a plan for the next few years on that before we consider whether we go any wider.

#### **QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILLIAMS**

Parking and congestion in my Ward of Pontprennau and Old St Mellons is already at unsustainable levels. Parking around Pontprennau Primary School is in urgent need of improvement.

The Council agreed to pursue plans for a walking bus to alleviate parking pressures around Pontprennau Primary School. Can the Cabinet Member provide an update on the walking bus for Pontprennau Primary School and the steps being taken to improve congestion with many commuters using Heol Pontprennau as a through road to access the M4 and Eastern Avenue, adding to congestion pressures?

# REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

Thanks again for the visit, I did come and see the school in question with you and see some of the issues faced there. A walking bus is primarily the responsibility of individual schools but officers have met with the school and identified suitable routes and drop off areas and that has involved undertaking a risk assessment.

The school needs to identify and provide parent volunteers in order to proceed with the Walking Bus, who will be supported with appropriate training and guidance.

Officers have also spoken recently about road safety at a whole school assembly as part of their work to help improve road safety awareness among pupils.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILLIAMS

Residents and parents in Pontprennau I think will be pleased with that response, it's good to know that the Council are fully behind the school in looking to achieve a walking bus.

There was a part two of my question to you and that is - what is the Council doing to improve congestion and vehicle usage that is using Heol Pontprennau as a through road to access Eastern Avenue and the M4?

We have quite a lot of cars that are coming through the community making it quite dangerous so what are your plans to improve that?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

I could go on about all the different things we are doing around transport which I am not going to do but a walking bus is one of the things, as you know we are doing work on the interchange there to try and increase services which are very close to that as well as the different things we are trying to do to improve bus and cycling.

I also know that officers are meeting with the business park there around trying to displace some of the parking there and get people into the interchange rather than parking there.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MOLIK

My concern is regarding a primary school in my ward, Lakeside Primary which is tucked in amongst narrow roads, but on the route of travel the Children cross Celyn Avenue, Lakeside Drive or Cefn Coed which are busy wide roads. For young children traveling to school, it could be quite dangerous for them. We don't have any

safe crossing around that school, and we don't have any clear signage regarding that school being there. I would like to ask Councillor Wild if he is willing to work with me to address this issue in my ward and make the route safer for children travelling to Lakeside Primary.

## REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

Yes absolutely it sounds like a real priority for us to go and have a look at that.

# **QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR NAUGHTON**

Could the Cabinet Member make an assurance that assessment information about carers of young disabled people will be available electronically by 2018/19?

#### REPLY – COUNTY COUNCILLOR HINCHEY

Following on from our conversation I have slightly altered the answer. There is no single definition of 'young people' and various terms encompassing different age bands are used to define 'young disabled people', within an overall range of 16 to 25 years of age.

However, I am able to reassure you that significant work is currently underway, to revise data capture and associated documents, to ensure that with effect from 2018/19 this information will be captured and held electronically on our Care First system on a secure and confidential basis.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR NAUGHTON

With information hopefully being online electronically by 2018/19, can we then put the information online so it's easier for residents of Cardiff to access the information.

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR HINCHEY

Yes, obviously with the caveat that it needs to be secure and confidential and we are going through a kind of procurement exercise about the best care system that we are engaging in. There is an all Wales programme about that.

If we had gone into the detail and tried to break down information which I think you were getting at in your FOI, it would have taken a substantial amount of time over the £450 FOI limit to have done that but we are nearly there and I am certainly going to keep you updated as we move towards that but the straight answer to your question is hopefully yes.

### QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR LENT

Has Cardiff Council been consulted on the issue of the marine disposal of 300,000 tonnes of radioactively contaminated dredged sediments from the proposed Bridgewater Bay/Hinkley Point C new nuclear reactor at the "Cardiff Bay Grounds" marine disposal site?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

The Council was consulted back in 2013 on the previous application for a marine license to dispose of the dredged material at the Cardiff Grounds site in the Severn Estuary.

We have not been consulted further on this matter following the Written Statement that was issued by the Cabinet Secretary for Environment and Rural Affairs on 29<sup>th</sup> September.

# SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR LENT

Would the Council support measures to ensure that a full environmental impact assessment, complete radiological analysis and pool sampling are carried out under the auspices of Natural Resources Wales before any dumping of Hinkley Point sediment is permitted in Cardiff Bay grounds.

### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

I would expect that virtually everything you've asked for is part of the license application, what they have to do to actually get the license to do what they have to do. The Council are not in a position to do it, it's a Natural Resources Wales matter.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILLIAMS

Councillor Michael will of course be aware that when Welsh Government were consulted on this they decided to remain neutral.

In light of the comments and observations made by Councillor Lent, I'm looking for Councillor Michael's opinion on whether he supports the Welsh Government in their decision to remain neutral on the dumping of 300,000 tonnes of radioactive contaminated dredged sediment in Cardiff Bay grounds. What is his view on Welsh Government's view?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

I think there is a bit of confusion, a bit silliness going on here. Radioactivity is everywhere, not just in this mud, its everywhere across the world, it's a natural occurring substance, so this is nothing out of the ordinary and on any given day there are thousands and thousands of tonnes of mud swirling around that estuary by the tides. This just happens to occur naturally, so dredging it is just taking it from A to B.

There is a legal process to get the license, this is what is going through at the moment, and I am happy with that legal process.

#### **QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR HUDSON**

With the removal of the facility to dispose of the higher value recyclable items of scrap metal and rubble at the Wedal Road HWRC, what is the impact on the site and will this make the centre less financially viable?

### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

The removal of waste facilities to dispose of rubble and scrap metal waste, in exchange for facilities to dispose of carpets and mattresses, has been done to assist in reducing noise levels at the site. This won't change the financial viability of the site.

# SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR HUDSON

I want to know was pressure brought by the neighbours of Wedal Road, either the residential development or the care home, to take these items out perhaps because of the noise element.

## REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

We had several complaints about the noise from various residents groups there and NRW were involved in this and a lot of discussions took place. It was deemed easier to actually take these two away and put something there that can be recycled that wouldn't create nuisance for the neighbourhood, which is exactly what we did.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MOLIK

The noise level the residents raised which led to this change in service, this service was being provided long before the resident accommodation was made. Is this a move towards closure of Wedal Road?

If it is, when do you intend to close it and if you do close it will we have a fully working service within the northern arc of the City before you do close it.

#### REPLY – COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

Just because something has been there for a long time, doesn't mean you can't do something about it. The noise levels were quite loud and we have done something about it.

As for the rest of Wedal Road, I'm afraid you will have to wait for my statement.

# **QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR CONGREVE**

The future of libraries across the city is a concern for many residents. What is the commitment of this Labour administration to continue to fund this invaluable service and, in particular, the shining example of Rhydypennau Library?

### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR THORNE

This Labour Administration's policy is clear in that we are committed to retaining a network of libraries across the city.

I am happy to confirm that there will be no proposed budget reduction linked to the standalone branch libraries in 2018/19 and this, of course, includes Rhydypennau Library.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR CONGREVE

I want to expand a little bit on what Rhydypennau library provides for the community. I held my surgery there on Saturday and during that time, there was a father and toddler group enjoying rhyme time which included them singing many a familiar song including The Wheels on the Bus, there was also a father and daughter duo that were playing in the library and there was a singalong and there was very active participation by the members of the library at the time. This is a hub of activity that is well appreciated by our local residents in the community.

Will you join me in congratulating the wonderful staff at Rhydypennau library and that you will as you say, continue to fully fund this service that is very much appreciated by the residents?

# REPLY – COUNTY COUNCILLOR THORNE

I agree, I recently spoke at Council and said I visited the libraries and Rhydypennau was one of those and the events that were taking place on that day were amazing and in fact I was moved to tears at one point. There was an artist there who sketched me as I walked around and I have to say I thought well that's me. There was an older persons club a singalong and it was just amazing.

Yes they do amazing things as they do in many other libraries and yes they are the heart of the community and that's why we want to protect them.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR COWAN

Obviously we didn't get a chance before when you didn't respond, so this is really on behalf of Councillor Joel Williams, Oliver Owen and myself.

In your manifesto there was a commitment to all libraries and now you are talking about a network of libraries, can you clarify if that is exactly the same thing and also there has been no mention of mobile libraries.

What discussions have you had with Cabinet colleagues about the future of libraries and can you commit today that they will be protected throughout this administration?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNILLOR THORNE

I guess the answer is yes, I think I mentioned at the last Council that we are looking at innovative ways to make sure that we protect those services in all areas and that is what we are doing. There probably will be savings or income from that but it means we are going to be able to protect all the library services, all the stand alone libraries, that's our commitment and has been from the start of this administration and will continue to be.

#### QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR BURKE-DAVIES

The Cardiff Half Marathon was a huge success, once again, for the city and all those who took part. However, I have been contacted by residents in Llandaff North who were frustrated to see that our public bins, particularly those in Station Road, were not collected throughout Sunday 1<sup>st</sup> of October. Can the Cabinet Member give a commitment that major events in Cardiff will not affect the frequency with which refuse is collected from the outer city Wards?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCLLOR THORNE

It is not possible to guarantee that major events in the city will not affect our cleansing and waste services, as road closures and other impacts can result in delays to operations. The cleansing service will target missed collections following any such event in order to minimise disturbance to residents.

## SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR BURKE-DAVIES

I would like to lobby and advocate that Llandaff North is an area of Cardiff that has undergone rapid growth owing to the new estate, families moving to the area because of the local amenities, close to the city and we have good schools. We have a high street that has a new Lidl, bakeries and lots of shops and our high street is very well used.

This issue isn't a one off when there is an event, this issue is happening on a weekly basis and I have residents writing to me on a regular basis about the state of the high street and I notice it myself when I pop to the co-op on a Sunday morning, the state of the high street is deteriorating and on that basis I would really like to urge your teams to consider more regular visits to Llandaff North and the outer lying areas to make sure that they are clean and tidy.

# REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR THORNE

The problem we have is that all of these events, and we are an events City at the end of the day and we do go back and clean up afterwards, as anyone who saw the headline in the Echo after the Wales v Ireland game.

I'm more than happy to meet you and to discuss your ward, you will find as we start rolling out the ward profiles, where we actually meet with Councillors and find out what concerns are in their wards, issues like that will be taken on board. I'm more than happy to arrange a meeting with you, myself and officers to discuss Llandaff North.

### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR PARKHILL

As we are trying to attract more and more events in the city, and bringing more major events, will the Cabinet consider looking at spreading the burden between different wards and not having the same wards affected time after time with major events with delays?

# REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLO THORNE

I'm puzzled as to how you would do that. Most of the events are in the town centre, you get events like the Half Marathon which does change, but most of the events are well known areas, we know where the fans will be and we target those.

I'm more than happy if you have any ideas let me know, email me.

#### QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DAVIES

Can you inform Council of the number of children in Cardiff schools receiving psychotherapy sessions together with a breakdown on the number in each age group?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MERRY

It's difficult to provide specific figures in direct response to your question, because the independent counselling service for young people in Cardiff does not deliver psychotherapy per se. Moreover, counsellors deliver an integrated approach to therapy.

I can confirm that 974 pupils made use of the service last year; however, a number of schools also employ counsellors directly and don't feed into our statistics.

I would be happy to provide you with a more detailed breakdown of the figures following the meeting, rather than trying to read it all out in the time available.

# <u>SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR TIM DAVIES</u>

I'm grateful for that answer, there does appear to be quite a number of significant children who are receiving such therapy in different areas, and I wonder whether it would be helpful if these figures could be collated together and put them as a performance indicator?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MERRY

I'm quite happy if you email me after the meeting we could look at it.

I think the implication of the response I was provided by officers is that action might be quite difficult to do but if you email it over to me I will ask officers to look into it.

#### QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CARTER

Could the Cabinet Member please explain who gave GLL/Better permission to close the Pentwyn Leisure Centre cafe, removing a popular local service and making 4 staff redundant?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRADBURT

There are provisions within the contract that enable GLL to modify the service, over the term of the arrangements, to respond to trends, demand and, most importantly, to sustain provision in the medium to long term.

I chair a Project Liaison Board as part of the governance arrangements for the partnership at which key service issues are discussed. This issue was raised with the Council by GLL and we instructed them to consult with the trade unions and those staff affected by the closure proposal. This statutory process is still ongoing.

I have the upmost sympathy for those staff affected by GLL's proposals. I recognise how important paid employment is having been made redundant myself in the past and, through discussions with GLL, I can advise that they are committed to finding redeployment opportunities for the staff in question.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR CARTER

Thank you for that update and that commitment.

Do you think it is right that local Members should have no consultation in a process that takes away a community service in their ward?

#### REPLY – COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRADBURY

There is a statutory consultation period going on and you can take part in that consultation period if you like. I would say to the Member that from the period from 2004 to 2012, 53 FTE people in leisure were made redundant because of changes in trends, one of those decisions was the closure of Fairwater Leisure Centre bar because it was being heavily subsidised.

These are difficult decisions, if the Member wants me to broker a meeting between myself and Sarah Stork who manages the contract, I'm more than happy for the Member to have that meeting so he is aware how he can take part in the statutory consultation that is going on, this is a GLL decision not a Council decision but it is important still and we have made it perfectly clear to GLL that Local Members have a voice in the decisions that affect local services.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION COUNTY COUNCILLOR GRAHAM THOMAS

I think Councillor Carter had raised a very important question. My mother is a regular user of Llanishen Leisure Centre council services, at least once a week and recently she has been speaking to me about concerns of the Bowls Club, the Badminton Club, free swimming lessons, the café is already closed. What protections have the Council got in place to stop these probably less profitable but crucial services for the elderly from being closed down?

# REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRADBURY

As part of the contract any service changes that have to be made have to go through the project liaison board within 90 days of any service change, if there are services that are much loved and we feel offers a local service we can ask GLL to reconsider any changes that they make; similar to what we are talking about there is a statutory consultation for any change of service that I mentioned to Councillor Carter.

It's not all bad though I mean there is investment going into the service and the leisure centre you are referring to is actually getting substantial capital investment into it which is a sign of the long term commitment of this Council and GLL in providing top quality leisure facilities right across this city.

### QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR JACOBSEN

Would the Cabinet Member please review S7 of the Waste Container policy which has not been looked at since December 2016?

## REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

The policy was agreed in 2015 and reviewed in December 2016. There are no immediate plans to review the policy again, but I would be happy to meet with you to discuss any specific issues that you or local residents may have.

### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR JACOBSON

Can the Cabinet Member confirm that the current charge of £25 levied on new builds as in table 1 of your policy and that the first bin will not be charged directly to residents such as new residents moving into 111 new homes being built at East Side Quarter in Llanedeyrn in my constituency?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

I understand what you are saying but really every new household, its £50, 2 bins and green and a black bin. If it's a social landlord I'd expect them to contribute, if its someone buying a brand new private house, you wouldn't get a new house in that area for less than £280k so £50 is not a great deal of money.

If you look at it from our angle, we are looking to build 20,000 houses in this city, at £50 a time you are looking at £1million, if I change that decision to please you in Llanedeyrn and Pentwyn, then I'm afraid I'll have to do it for everyone and that's not possible.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR CARTER

You did echo the views that officers have given us in their responses as well. I take your point about the cost but is it possible for you and officers to go away and look at whether those costs could be met by the developers rather than the individuals. I take your point that it's a huge cost for us as a Council when multiplied by that field but for a Developer who is taking £280k off someone's hands for a private house the least they could do is throw in 2 plastic bins plus a small caddy to go with it, that would be a reasonable thing they could contribute?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

What is reasonable to me and you may not be reasonable to a developer. I'll pass on your thoughts.

#### QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR OWEN

Many Rhiwbina residents and residents across Cardiff use their green bins not only to dispose of their personal garden waste at this time of the year, but also to dispose of leaves and branches they have cleared from their streets, roads and avenues. Would the Council therefore please consider extending the regular green bin collections to the end of November, so as to help residents with the annual autumn clear up?

# REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

The seasonal green waste collections change city-wide throughout November. Your actually asking me to extend it until the end of November but Rhiwbina doesn't actually change until 24<sup>th</sup> November anyway because of the way it is phased in. We phase it so the leafier suburbs get longer use of the bins, what you are asking me for is already done.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR OWEN

It is my understanding that they come to an end I believe in a week or two, they aren't actually carried forward every fortnight. I think the general point I am trying to make is that at this time of the year, a lot of residents do use those bins to help the Council keep the streets tidier, and also when people are able to use their green bins to help the Council it also alleviates flooding problems and helps elderly and disabled people get around because there is less of an impediment to them doing it.

This issue has been raised I believe a year ago so can I ask you what considerations you have had of extending these services further?

#### REPLY – COUNTY COUNCILLOR MICHAEL

We looked at the results at what we had last year and we looked at these again. The date isn't a mandatory date for the whole city, some wards actually have bins longer, the North of the City have them until the end of November, the month you've asked me to extend for is already there.

#### QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR OWEN JONES

Following on from this Labour Council's commitment to encouraging people to cycle in the city, what measures are we introducing at the planning stage to ensure that all offices and workplaces currently being built have adequate facilities for commuters who want to cycle?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

Offices and workplaces have a big role to play in terms of getting more people cycling. There are some things we can do with some SPG's that are coming forward

within our planning department. There is a new one that is being revised at the moment coming forward which is still being drafted up which will bring in place measures so that new builds will include secure long term parking and changing facilities, obviously we need to put those to the test.

I'm pleased to see the BBC with their new buildings have got an awful lot of bike parking and showers and changing facilities. I was having a discussion this week with one of our businesses Capital Law who spoke about what a difference it had made to their business by putting in place really good quality showers and lockers, it had made cycling revolution within the workplace. It's something that we are really keen to do, next week as part of the bike life launch in terms of getting a number of businesses involved Councillor Thomas and I are meeting them and it will be another thing we will discuss with them.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR OWEN JONES

I'm very glad to see the Council committed towards improving active travel in our City. Cardiff is very flat, which is ideal for cycling and walking, however sadly it is also very rainy. Having shower facilities in all offices in large businesses would be a great incentive for those who would like to cycle to work. I welcome the work you are doing with new builds.

Can the Council look at ways we can encourage older office buildings such as ones owned by the council like this very building to possibly install facilities so that all stakeholders link up to encourage active travel across the city?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

I think it's difficult to do as part of planning, but it is something we are doing in terms of culture and something we should be trying to do as leadership within the City and all of us should be talking to the businesses that we know about how they can do that kind of work, I think it's a really good idea.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR DRISCOLL

Now that the 20mph zones are in operation in Pontcanna and Riverside, do you think that this has made the area safer for cyclists and pedestrians and what plans do you have to enforce the 20 mph limit and if the roads are now safer for cyclists, as I'm sure you will say they are, are you going to use enforcement measures also to force cyclists off the pavements to make it safer for pedestrians.

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

I do think cars are going slower across Canton and Riverside although some are still speeding, we discussed earlier in my response to Councillor Gordon about what we are going to do about enforcement but I think cyclists have also got a role to play in that. I accept your point about cyclists on pavements, I think part of this as well as educating drivers and trying to create that culture that has to come from the cycling community but they are not one homogenous group, so it's about culture change and

trying to get people to share the space better between pedestrians, cyclists and drivers and other people using the roads.

I'm not trying to skip the question but I gave a long answer to Councillor Gordon before exactly on that.

#### QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR REES

What progress has been made in the last month with a Green Paper on traffic congestion and transport in the City?

### REPLY - COUNTY COUNILLOR WILD

I would refer you to the statement I made this evening which you may not have seen when you put this together, so refer to my statement as that gives an update to where we are at with the Green paper but also just to say how pleased I was to meet your colleagues, Councillors Parkhill and Robson to look at how we scope out that Green paper as I promised I would do.

### SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION COUNTY COUNCILLOR REES

I realise that the Labour Party are still members of the Flat Earth Society but I was looking for more detail than that. Has a team been set up to produce the Green paper and can you confirm that they will be surveying congestion, numbers of vehicles on our main roads, air quality on those roads, the number of RTA's on sections of road that are particularly vulnerable to tailbacks and congestion and will you outline to the Council to date as I wasn't satisfied with your statement, what exactly has been done to produce the Green paper by April 2018?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILD

Yes a team has been set up and meeting on a number of occasions across portfolio looking at the clean air with my colleagues on that.

In terms of the scoping I would just reiterate that I'm happy to meet with all parties and Members and I did meet with colleagues yesterday to look at the detail of that so I don't really want to go over that again now but I'm happy to meet with them again to go over the detail of exactly what is in it. It's likely to be pretty complex but I see no reason to rule anything out in terms of what could go in it so please feel free to pass anything onto me.

#### QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR LANCASTER

What co-operation is there between yourself and public transport providers when preparing for major events to take place in the city?

#### REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRADBURY

Consultation with all public transport providers is a key component of planning for major events.

Discussions take place at the initial bid stage and as soon as events are confirmed.

Where there is a need to provide additional services to support an event, the cost of these services would normally have to be underwritten by the event promoter or government, or a combination of both.

# SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR LANCASTER

We have the Anthony Joshua flight taking place in Cardiff this weekend and we have Cardiff vs Millwall on the same day which will result in over 100k sports fans coming to the City, many of them will come from over the bridge. You might expect that we increase the level of public transport services to cover the increased demand whereas in fact, as you know, we will have reduced provision over the weekend and with a lot of train services cancelled. I can't be alone in thinking that this situation is somewhat farcical, we are trying to position ourselves as a leading City indeed the Capital Ambition statement from the Cabinet earlier this year wishes Cardiff to be.

How are we going to plan and attract these events if we don't have the correct public service provision in place?

#### REPLY – COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRADBURY

I will be raising this issue with Network Rail and all the other train providers and we will look at this seriously. What would be a great signal for Cardiff and Wales would be if you electrified the railway all the way to Swansea.

# SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTION - COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOWELLS

I went on the website and looked at our own travel advice for Saturday and can I ask that you review how we get that information out there because the information about the trains not being available after the fight has finished is tucked away right at the bottom of the web page and that should be flagged up to people so that they know what they are up against.

# REPLY - COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRABURY

I have just looked at Chief Executive and asked him to do that as a matter of priority. I will ask Communications to make sure that we improve on that.

79 : URGENT BUSINESS

80 : COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

The Council was requested to approve changes to Committee Membership

RESOLVED – That the following appointments to Committee vacancies be approved in accordance with Party Group wishes:

| Committee                         |             | Nomination                                    |
|-----------------------------------|-------------|---|
| Public Protection<br>Committee    | 2 vacancies | Councillor Robson to fill Plaid vacancy       |
| Health & Safety<br>Advisory Group | 1 vacancy   | Councillor Murphy to replace Councillor Patel |

#### 81 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

The following Written Questions were received in accordance with Council Procedure Rules 17(f) and circulated to all Members at 12 noon on 26 October 2017

# CHAIR OF PLANNING COMMITTEE - COUNCILLOR KEITH JONES WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR TAYLOR

What consideration can be given to student numbers and student population growth when determining planning applications for large purpose-built student accommodation?

# Reply

National planning guidance states that it is the duty of local planning authorities to decide planning applications on their planning merits.

Material planning considerations must be fairly and reasonably related to the development concerned. The Courts are ultimately the final arbiters of what may be regarded as material considerations in relation to any particular application, but they include the number, size, layout, design and appearance of buildings, the means of access, landscaping, service availability and the impact on the neighbourhood and on the environment. The guidance further states that the weight attached to material considerations is a matter of judgement.

In this respect, the Council – as the Local Planning Authority – has a duty to carefully consider all submitted proposals in line with this guidance. The weight afforded to considerations regarding student numbers would need to be assessed on a case-by-case basis along with other material considerations.

# CHILDREN AND FAMILIES - COUNCILLOR GRAHAM HINCHEY WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH

A recently published research report authored by Manchester University's Dr Patricio Troncoso has found that 50% of children referred to UK children's services in the 2010-11 financial year were re-referred by the end of 2014-15. The report was based on a study of 498,867 children referred in 2010-11, within 145 local authorities and

more detailed modelling based on a subset of 90,209 children within 144 local authorities.

Did Cardiff Council participate in this research and what percentage of children referred to Cardiff children's services in the 2010-11 financial year were re-referred by the end of 2014-15?

### Reply

To the best of our knowledge, Cardiff Children's Services did not participate in this research. 47.7% of individual children referred to Children's Services in Cardiff in 2010-11 were re-referred by the end of 2014-15. However, this figure should be treated with caution and does not necessarily indicate, in any given case, that the initial referral or any subsequent re-referral related to a substantive concern. In very many cases, initial or subsequent referrals would have, in effect, been an 'information only' referral leading to no further action being taken.

# WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH

Cabinet has approved proposals to establish a regional Social Care Workforce Development Training Unit serving Cardiff and the Vale Councils to ensure high-quality training provision across the social care sector in the two local authority areas, which is a very welcome development. However, as the proposals afford no direct Member involvement from Cardiff Council and/or the Vale of Glamorgan Council in the proposed governance arrangements and it is not proposed to create a formal joint committee, will this authority agree to sharing the annual reports and work plans of the collaboration with the Children and Young People and/or Community and Adult Services scrutiny committee(s) for them to examine?

# Reply

It is intended that both Councils will conclude a formal "Partnership Agreement" that is being developed by Legal Services and Social Services. The agreement will, amongst other things, include the terms of reference and membership of the Management and Governance Boards that will receive performance reports at agreed intervals.

The Chair of the Regional Workforce Partnership Board agrees that it would be appropriate for any annual or other significant reports relating to the work of the Board to be shared with relevant Scrutiny or other Council Committees in each of the local authorities, subject to the agreement of the relevant Committee Chairperson.

# EDUCATION, EMPLOYMENT AND SKILLS - COUNCILLOR SARAH MERRY WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH

A number of parents from across South Wales have expressed concerns around the controversial creationist evangelical group OAC Ministries visiting primary schools in

the region, with some parents withdrawing their children from lessons involving the group, and others expressing alarm that the group has apparently performed assemblies and other activities involving their children without their prior knowledge. What is Cardiff Council doing to ensure that schools and governing bodies make sure that acts of collective worship etc. are appropriate and non-discriminatory, and that parents are given advanced notice that OAC Ministries will be visiting their children's school?

# Reply

I am aware that some parents have raised concerns about this particular group's visits to schools in Cardiff. I have therefore asked officers to remind all schools and Governing Bodies that they should have in place a visitor policy to ensure that the views and values of visitors are appropriate for the context of the school and to the age of the children they are speaking to.

I have also asked officers to remind all schools that they should also ensure that parents should be informed in advance of any external visitors who will be involved in activities with their children or performing assemblies at the school. Officers will continue to work with schools and governors to make sure that this is the case.

# WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE

How many schools were used as polling stations for the Local Authority Elections in May 2017 and the UK General Election in June?

How many of these schools were closed or partially closed to pupils and how many pupils were unable to attend school on these days?

#### Reply

In both the County Council Elections that were held on 4 May 2017 and the UK Parliamentary Election that was held on 8 June 2017, the Council used 28 schools as polling stations; of which 14 schools were open and 14 were closed or partially closed to pupils. The number of pupils who were unable to attend school on each of these days was 2,962.

All Council premises are usually given at least 11 months' notice that the Electoral Services team will require use of their premise as a polling station, unless a snap Parliamentary Election is called as happened earlier this year.

The Electoral Services team tries to avoid using schools, colleges and community centres as much as possible and seeks to use alternative venues but, on many occasions, there is no other suitable venue within the polling district.

# WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE

What is the number and percentage of pupils in Y11 in:

- a) English Medium;
- b) Welsh Medium;
- c) Faith Schools:
- d) All Cardiff Schools

who obtained an A\*-C qualification in GCSE Welsh 1st or 2nd Language (excluding Welsh Short Course GCSE) as a total and percentage of all pupils on school rolls in Y11?

# Reply

| 2017 Results – Provisional Data |                   |   |   |  |
|---------------------------------|-------------------|---|---|--|
|                                 | Year 11<br>Cohort | Number of Year 11<br>Pupils Achieving<br>A*-C in GCSE<br>Welsh 1st or 2nd<br>Language | Percentage of Year<br>11 Pupils Achieving<br>A*-C in GCSE<br>Welsh 1st or 2nd<br>Language |  |
| English Medium*                 | 1897              | 710**   | 37.43%  |  |
| Faith Schools                   | 887               | 440   | 49.61%  |  |
| Welsh Medium                    | 381               | 315   | 82.68%  |  |
| All Cardiff Schools***          | 3283              | 1465  | 44.62%  |  |

<sup>\*</sup> English medium is mainstream excluding faith schools

# FINANCE, MODERNISATION AND PERFORMANCE - COUNCILLOR CHRIS WEAVER

# WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR SANDREY

What has been the take up on the council's Voluntary Redundancy Scheme and has there been any assessment of the potential impact in terms of operational capacity?

#### Reply

The take up of the scheme varies from year to year based on the number of corporate posts that require deletion due to savings proposals and changes to services.

In the 2016/17 financial year, 40 corporate employees (excluding schools) took up the scheme and, up to the end of September 2017 in the current financial year, the respective number is 15.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Includes 2 pupils who achieved an AS level but are in Year 11.

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> Includes special schools, Pupil Referral Unit and Education Other Than at School (EOTAS)

As part of the process for voluntary redundancy, corporate service areas have to provide details of any effects on operational capacity and this information is provided on the business case and signed off by the Director of that service.

#### WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOWELLS

A range of local authorities across the UK have introduced measures to exempt care leavers from council tax. Is this something that Cardiff Council has considered?

## Reply

I can confirm that there is currently no statutory exemption within the Council Tax legislation for care leavers. The Council does have discretionary powers provided under Section 13A(1)(c) of the Local Government Finance Act 1992 whereby it can consider writing off some or all of the Council Tax charges for certain individuals or groups of individuals and I suspect that it may be under this legislation that other authorities have been minded to grant relief.

The Council's Discretionary Relief Policy stipulates that the individual concerned or their advocate/appointee must make an application, which will be treated on its own merits. To qualify for the reduction, there must be clear evidence of exceptional circumstances given that the cost of awarding the reduction has to be funded from within the total income generated by Council Tax. Therefore, the current practice is that any applications for this reduction will be considered on a case-by-case basis.

With regard to a category of exemption for all care leavers, the Council will contact the Welsh Government in order to discuss the Children's Society campaign and to find out if there are any plans to introduce such an exemption nationally. However, the current Welsh Government position indicates that local authorities have discretion to use their powers to grant this exemption.

The Council is currently seeking to identify the potential numbers of care leavers that would be affected in the event of any decision being taken.

# WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOWELLS

How many people with dementia are 'disregarded' for council tax purposes in Cardiff and how is this council tax exemption communicated to residents?

#### Reply

There are two different types of reduction that can be applicable to persons who are described and more widely defined in Council Tax legislation as 'severely mentally impaired'.

Firstly, where a property is solely occupied by persons who are severely mentally impaired, who would otherwise be liable to the charge, then there is a full exemption from the charge.

Secondly, persons who are severely mentally impaired are also prescribed within the Council Tax legislation as one of the categories of people who are disregarded (or not counted) for the purposes of calculating a discount from the charge.

The Council Tax bill for a property where one of two residents is not counted will be the same as that for a property with only one resident. That is, you will get a 25% discount. If someone who is not counted lives alone, or only with others who are not counted, a 50% discount applies. If there are two or more residents who are counted, no discount can be applicable irrespective of who else lives at the property.

There are currently 375 properties that are exempt from the charge on the grounds that they are solely occupied by severely mentally impaired persons and there are 551 properties where a disregarded discount is currently being awarded. Therefore, in total, we are currently awarding reductions on 926 properties in Cardiff.

Both of these types of reduction are detailed and explained on the Council's website and within the explanatory notes which supplement each Council Tax bill that is issued (a hard copy of the explanatory notes is now only provided on request as each bill contains details of where they are situated on the Council's website).

The Council Tax Enquiry Form, which is often issued when there is a change in occupants of a property, also gives details of the discounts/exemptions that can be claimed and contains an invitation to apply for them.

In addition to this, all Council Tax, Contact Centre and Hub staff who deal with Council Tax enquiries are trained to both identify these types of discount/exemption and to actively promote them. This includes situations where a carer discount may be granted, in addition to a discount on the grounds of severe mental impairment.

# HOUSING AND COMMUNITIES - COUNCILLOR LYNDA THORNE WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR NAUGHTON

What is the council's progress with implementing the Housing First model?

# Reply

The Council has entered into a partnership with the Salvation Army to develop a Housing First pilot scheme of up to 10 units. This will house rough sleepers and other vulnerable individuals in self-contained accommodation without going down the normal pathway through hostels and supported provision.

A service specification has been developed, along with referral and assessment processes, and a multi-disciplinary team has been established. In addition, a Housing

First Steering Group has been set up to help transition rough sleepers effectively into the Housing First project.

The Council and three Registered Social Landlords (Wales and West Housing Association, Taff Housing Association and Linc Housing Association) have committed properties to the scheme. The first referrals of suitable clients have been made and the first two placements will be made in early November 2017.

The Housing First project is just one of the many initiatives that the Council and third sector partners are taking forward to try to address the issue of rough sleeping in Cardiff in line with our Rough Sleeper Strategy 2017-20.

#### WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH

The Bristol Post recently reported (06/09/17) on the use of the synthetic drug Spice in the city, claiming the 'police admit there is little they can do to stop what is fast becoming an epidemic.' The report stated that a huge influx of stronger versions of the drug are causing a sharp increase of casualties in Bristol city centre – and local police reportedly admitted the support services to help people get off the drug were 'not particularly great'. Could the Cabinet Member comment on the known extent of Spice use in Cardiff, what support partner agencies are offering to users, and the sustainability of these services going forward?

#### Reply

Cardiff Council is a constituent member of Cardiff and Vale Substance Misuse Area Planning Board (APB). The APB is responsible for delivering and performance managing all substance misuse services across Cardiff from prevention, education and early intervention, through harm reduction and treatment and aftercare.

There have been anecdotal reports of increased levels of Spice use in the city, particularly among the homeless population but, as yet, there is no quantitative evidence to support these claims.

All preventative, education, treatment and support work in Cardiff has been developed in response to a potential increase in Spice use in the city. The 'Taith' open access, engagement and outreach service is fully qualified to respond to presentations of Spice use; although, again, the numbers are not showing up as being significant at the present time.

The APB has been proactive in developing the content of schools based education programmes and all prevention work to include the risks posed by Novel Psychoactive Substances (NPS). It has also implemented a staff training programme for the substance misuse sector on identifying and responding to NPS in treatment, so that all key workers are equipped with the necessary knowledge and skills to address the needs of service users who disclose use of Spice.

The APB continues to monitor trends by analysing the rates of different substances used by those accessing treatment and support, and by maintaining oversight of appropriate data in case there is an increasing in emergency presentations that are related to use of NPS in Cardiff.

### WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH

Ealing Council has made a landmark decision committing to find ways to create 'buffer zones' around abortion clinics to prevent pro-life campaigners from harassing women using these services and stopping prayer groups congregating nearby holding 'vigils'. The Council will now examine options, before holding a consultation period. One option would be to enforce a Public Space Protection Order (PSPO), which would ban such groups from standing outside of clinics in the borough. Richard Bentley, managing director at Marie Stopes UK, has claimed that the decision could have a knock-on effect with clinics across the country:

"This groundbreaking move by Ealing Council sets a national precedent for ending the harassment of women using legal healthcare services. We hope that other local authorities will follow this example and act to increase protection for women in their area."

Will Cardiff Council commit to considering options to safeguard women using these healthcare facilities in the city and put the options out to public consultation?

#### Reply

The Safer & Cohesive Communities Programme Board is currently working with the Police, Neighbourhood Services and Shared Regulatory Services to prepare policy statements on a number of different applications of Public Space Protection Orders (PSPO) in the city; all of which will be consulted on and piloted once developed.

A steering group has been established to co-ordinate this activity. It is proposed that consideration will be given over the coming months to the progress that Ealing Council makes regarding the decision to create a buffer zone around clinics, including using a PSPO to ban groups from holding vigils and prayer groups within an identified area.

We are committed to developing good practice in the application of Public Space Protection Orders here in Cardiff and will consider appropriate options for their application in order to address any safeguarding concerns that may arise locally.

#### WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE

Will the Council provide an update on progress with the relocation of Llanishen Library into Llanishen Police Station to create a new Community Hub for Llanishen and Thornhill?

# Reply

I can report that the building works being undertaken by Knox & Wells are progressing well and are due to be completed in early November 2017. This will be followed by a period of fitting-out and IT installation and it is anticipated that the new Hub will open to the public on Monday 27<sup>th</sup> November 2017.

# INVESTMENT AND DEVELOPMENT - COUNCILLOR RUSSELL GOODWAY WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR COWAN

Are there any ongoing or residual costs to the Council arising from the Christmas Tree Contract entered into in 2016?

### Reply

The Councillor will be aware that the contract with MK Illuminations was for a package of illuminated attractions, which included the artificial tree, and was for three years and, therefore, has two years left to run.

The Councillor will also be aware that, as a result of the late delivery of the artificial tree last Christmas, MK Illuminations made five illuminated reindeer available, free of charge, and which proved to be extremely popular.

The Council remains committed to the original contract but, in order to address the issues associated with the artificial tree, council officers have worked with MK Illuminations to find a different location for the tree outside Cardiff and for Cardiff to retain the reindeer for this year and next. There has been no reduction in the contract price as a result of the change.

The Councillor will no doubt welcome the fact that, this year, the city will be provided with a real Christmas tree outside the main entrance to Cardiff Castle, which will be sponsored by Sayers Amusements, the operator of Winter Wonderland. I understand that Rightacres, the developer of Central Square, is also exploring the possibility of providing a real tree within the development.

Furthermore, taxpayers will be pleased that council officers have secured additional sponsorship for the city's Christmas offer which, taken together, means that the attractions this year will be delivered at a total cost to the Council of £8,000 compared to some £220,000 before 2012.

#### WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE

Will the Council provide a list of the furniture which was removed from City Hall and placed in storage ahead of the 1998 European Summit held in Cardiff City Hall?

How much has the Council spent in storage costs for the original items of furniture and what items, if any, have since been disposed of by the Council?

### Reply

The Councillor may not be aware that, in order to accommodate the 1998 meeting of the European Council, City Hall was completely vacated to provide the organisers with a "clean" building.

Some items of furniture, fixtures and fittings were disposed of at that time due to their poor condition or because the decision was taken that they were surplus to requirements. The bulk of the items were, however, placed in storage with a significant amount being returned to the building following the event. Other items were kept in storage, in a private facility, until they were disposed of in 2010 following an independent valuation which concluded that the remaining items were in poor condition, of little or no interest in historical terms and of little or no value. The cost of storage over the thirteen year period is estimated to have amounted to some £400,000.

I am advised that a detailed inventory of the items disposed of is no longer available, but they did include:

- 37 x Oak Chairs
- 13 x Oak Chairs (broken)
- 40 x Carver Oak Chairs
- 18 x Carver Oak Chairs (broken)
- 5 x Blue/turquoise Chairs
- 2 x Curved Office Chairs (made of wood & leather but different to the oak chairs listed above)
- Various tables (large and very large sizes)
- 2 x Fire guards
- 4 x Book Cases

# STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT - COUNCILLOR CARO WILD WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR TAYLOR

What analysis has the Council conducted of student numbers and estimated student population growth in relation to the number of student rooms currently available in order to inform planning decisions in relation to large purpose-built student accommodation?

#### Reply

Student numbers across the city are published by the Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA). Student numbers at Cardiff University and Cardiff Metropolitan

University collectively increased from 28,295 in 2000/01 to 43,260 in 2015/16, which is a growth rate of more than 50% over 15 years. This growth has stabilised in recent years.

In addition, the city is home to students from the University of South Wales, which incorporates the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama and has its Atrium campus in Cardiff. Students attending Further Education colleges or language schools also contribute to overall student numbers in Cardiff.

There is no statutory requirement for the Local Planning Authority to monitor student rooms/developments. The Council must determine a planning application, having regard to the Local Development Plan and all relevant material planning considerations.

#### WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR TAYLOR

Is it within the scope of the Council to introduce planning guidance which would make student population numbers a consideration as part of the planning approval process?

### Reply

The Council is currently preparing draft Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) on Student Accommodation. This document will build upon policies in the adopted Local Development Plan (LDP) and introduce more detailed guidance describing the material planning considerations upon which developments for new student accommodation will be assessed. However, our SPG cannot introduce new policy or attempt to rewrite national guidance.

#### WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR SANDREY

Has the administration considered applying to the LGA for access to their behavioural insights funding, with a view to establishing how best to promote and embed behaviour change in regards to transport modes in Cardiff? The deadline is November 10<sup>th</sup>.

# Reply

No, as I understand that this funding is only available to LGA member councils in England.

### WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOOD

The recent Client Earth report on air quality raised concerns that 9 schools in Cardiff, including 3 in Gabalfa, are exposed to Nitrogen Dioxide (NO2) levels above the recommended limit. Whilst these figures are estimates based on a computer model,

this is obviously concerning to pupils and their families in the affected schools. To provide peace of mind, can the council commit to real time air quality monitoring at these locations to provide reassurance to local residents?

### Reply

I am aware that Client Earth has identified 9 schools in Cardiff, which are indicated to be exceeding levels of the annual mean air quality standard for NO<sub>2</sub> (40μg/m³); however, these reported values need to be taken with caution.

As you highlight, these results have been produced using predictive computer modelling and are not from actual monitoring results from the schools, but from roads some distance away from the schools. The reported values do not take account for fall off of pollution levels away from the source and calculations can be made to estimate the levels of  $NO_2$  which may be experienced at the school sites. Taking the highest and, therefore, worst case reported figures presented by Client Earth, the levels at these schools would therefore fall well below the legal level of  $40\mu g/m^3$ . I would hope that this would help to alleviate any immediate concerns for staff, pupils and families in terms of the air quality at the 9 schools in question.

Nevertheless, as you will be aware, this administration has committed to developing a Clean Air Strategy with the aim of improving air quality across Cardiff in order to protect public health. One aspect of this strategy will be to improve the Council's real-time monitoring capabilities and officers from Shared Regulatory Services are currently assessing appropriate options in terms of suitable equipment and likely costs, for which the Council will need to consider. However, the choice of monitoring locations is made on a risk based approach and thus the location of any future real time monitoring will need to consider locations which are likely to have high levels of exposure such as residential facades.